

## **South Cambridgeshire District Council**

Minutes of a meeting of the Planning Committee held on  
Wednesday, 13 July 2022 at 10.00 a.m.

**PRESENT:** Councillor Henry Batchelor – Chair  
Councillor Peter Fane – Vice-Chair

**Councillors:** Bill Handley Dr. Tumi Hawkins  
Peter Sandford Dr. Richard Williams  
Mark Howell Richard Stobart

**Officers in attendance for all or part of the meeting:**  
Vanessa Blane (Senior Planning Lawyer), Mary Collins (Senior Planning Officer), Laurence Damary-Homan (Democratic Services Officer), Phil McIntosh (Interim Delivery Manager) and Michael Sexton (Area Development Manager)

Councillor Richard Stobart was in attendance remotely.

### **1. Chair's announcements**

The Chair made several brief housekeeping announcements. It was noted that Councillor Richard Stobart was attending remotely, and whilst he could take part in debate he could not vote on any applications.

The Chair invited the Interim Delivery Manager to provide an update on Minute 6 (22/00116/FUL – Milton) who informed the Committee that there was an issue with the ownership certificate submitted by the application, thus a resubmission of the certificate was required and a further round of consultation was necessary. The Chair, seconded by the Vice-Chair, proposed the deferral of the application and the Committee agreed to the deferral by affirmation.

### **2. Apologies**

Councillors Ariel Cahn, Dr Martin Cahn, Geoff Harvey, William Jackson-Wood and Heather Williams sent apologies for absence. Councillor Mark Howell was present as a substitute and Councillor Richard Stobart was present virtually as a substitute.

### **3. Declarations of Interest**

With respect to Minute 5 (21/00953/FUL – Girton), the returning Members (Councillors Batchelor, Fane, Handley, Hawkins, Howell and Williams) declared that they knew the objecting public speaker, Tom Bygott, from his time as a Councillor in the previous administration.

### **4. Minutes of Previous Meeting**

Councillor Peter Fane stated that he was listed as the Vice-Chair for the meeting despite sending apologies for absence and requested that this was corrected. With the correction,

the Committee authorised the Chair to sign the Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 16 June 2022 as correct record by affirmation.

#### 5. **21/00953/FUL - Former Hotel Felix, Whitehouse Lane, Girton**

The Senior Planning Officer informed the Committee of an objection received, an updated response from consultees regarding contaminated land and then presented the report. Members asked questions of clarity on the non-designated heritage asset (Howe House) and the comments from the Conservation Team, as well as the assessments of need for care in the area and the differing responses from the County Council and District officers.

The Committee was addressed by a public objector, Tom Bygott, and the agent of the applicant, David Roe. Members asked the agent questions of clarity on the impact on the trees on site, the need for care in the area and the potential occupants, as well as the condition of the existing buildings. Councillor Corinne Garvie, a local Member, had apologised for not being able to attend to speak on the application but had submitted a written submission. The Committee noted Councillor Garvie's submission.

In the debate, Members discussed a number of points. The impact of the development on trees onsite and the energy efficiency of the proposed buildings were examined by the Committee. The demand for care homes was further discussed and the necessity of a dementia research centre was explored in order to establish if the proposed development would satisfy the criteria to allow for development in the Cambridge Green Belt. Members raised concerns around the loss of the non-designated heritage asset and the comments of the Conservation Team. The concerns raised by the NHS Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Clinical Commissioning Group was discussed by Members who felt that, whilst GP provision was not a material consideration, it was important to recognise the comments of local healthcare providers.

The Committee agreed, by affirmation, to the following reasons for refusal if it were minded to refuse the application:

- 1- Harm to the Green Belt, contrary to Policy S/4 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018 and failing to satisfy paragraphs 147, 148, 149 and 150 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2021 (NPPF)
- 2- The loss of a non-designated heritage asset, contrary to policy NH/14 of the Local Plan and failing to satisfy paragraph 203 of the NPPF
- 3- Failure to provide the very special circumstances, including need for specialist housing, which outweigh the harms identified (to the Green Belt and heritage asset), therefore failing to satisfy paragraphs 147 and 148 of the NPPF

The Committee agreed to delegate authority to officers to provide the precise wording of the reasons for refusal in conjunction with the Chair and Vice-Chair.

The Committee unanimously voted to **refuse** the application.

#### 6. **22/00116/FUL - Car Park, Walkling Way, Milton**

For the reasons stated by the Interim Delivery Manager in Minute 1 (Chair's Announcements), the Chair, seconded by the Vice-Chair, proposed to defer the application.

By affirmation, the Committee agreed to **defer** the application.

## 7. **Enforcement Report**

The Chair referred Members to the report. The Interim Delivery Manager provided updates on personnel in the Enforcement Team and highlighted some of the updates provided in the report. Members raised points on the cases at Haden Way (Willingham), Burwash Manor Farm and Smithy Fen and requested further details on personnel in the Enforcement team.

The Committee **noted** the report.

## 8. **Appeals against Planning Decisions and Enforcement Action**

The Interim Delivery Manager offered comment to the Committee and the Senior Planning Lawyer presented a brief update on a judicial review regarding decisions made on an application in Northstowe. A request was made for an update on the case in Harston, which was provided by the Interim Delivery Manager, and the Committee discussed the decision at Land East Of Teversham Road, Fulbourn.

The Committee **noted** the report.

---

**The Meeting ended at 12.40 p.m.**

---